

Measure C costs comparison analysis
Sept. 26, 2011
Berkeley Pools Campaign

Comparative overhead costs for:

- **Measure FF (2008), branch libraries, data provided by Donna Corbeil**
- **Albany pools project, data provided by David Burke, project manager**
- **BUSD bond measure projects, 1992-2011, data provided by Lew Jones**
- **Measure C, official estimates by Cumming Corp., 12/8/2009**

Soft costs:

Measure FF/ libraries: 36.5 percent.

Albany pools, original budget: 18.7 percent. Current budget: 17.9 percent. Final expected: 17.9 percent.

BUSD: 21.8 percent.

Measure C: 45 percent

City/district administrative overhead:

Measure FF/ libraries: zero.

Albany pools (AUSD): zero.

BUSD (projects with external manager): 0.5 percent.

Measure C: ??? (presumably included in the soft costs)

Construction contingency:

Measure FF/ libraries: 8.6 percent.

Albany pools, original budget: 7.5 percent. Current budget: 11.4 percent. Final expected: 1.4 percent.

BUSD: 5 percent for new construction, 10 percent for remodels.

Measure C: 17.5 percent.

Double counting:

The City Manager's Aug. 19, 2011 memo to Council regarding Arch-Pac line items within the Cumming estimate showed that each of these line items included a construction contingency of 20 percent, thus duplicating the construction contingency of 17.5 percent that was included in the overall Cumming estimate. We have corrected for this double counting. In addition, Arch-Pac incorrectly included costs for remodeling the West Campus dive pool, while Measure C called for it to be demolished entirely and replaced by the new Warm Pool. We have corrected for this.

Project discrepancy:

The total Cumming estimate for the Measure C configuration was \$21.3 million, while Measure C on the June 8 ballot was \$22.6 million. This gap appears to consist almost entirely of soft costs, according to the City Manager's June 15 report to the June 28 Council meeting (which also claimed other costs that were already included in Cumming or had already been carried out and paid for, such as EIR preparation).

What Measure C would have cost* if it had used these projects' rates for soft costs and contingencies, and eliminated double counting:

Measure FF/libraries: \$17.4 million

Albany pools (original budget): \$15.0 million

BUSD: \$15.5 million

*As with any budget estimate, these numbers are approximate. We have extensively reviewed our calculations with construction budget experts to ensure accuracy, but numerous minor uncertainties remain because of incomplete data available.

Notes:

- The Cumming estimate added a multiplier of 5.0 percent for LEED Silver certification (with soft costs and contingencies multiplied on top of that). An Internet search indicates that LEED does not certify outdoor pools, and the City's Green Building Code appears to require LEED Silver certification only for buildings, not for outdoor facilities. While the indoor Warm Pool as well as the pool houses could be LEED certified, it appears that the outdoor pools themselves could not. Our costs analysis has not made adjustments for these factors, but they seem to overstate the LEED cost.
- Cumming's square footages for the various layouts at West Campus seem incorrect, possibly skewing the construction costs. For example, the size cited for the Warm Pool building's locker rooms, office and entry (a total of 1,860 square feet) would be non-functional, barely one-half the size of the locker rooms and entry for the West outdoor pool (3,550 square feet). We did not make adjustments for this, but it should be addressed by the planner and cost estimator.